Second Language and Culture Teaching in an ESL Classroom – Application of Literature Circles in an ESL Classroom

Xiaoshi Li

The University of Texas at San Antonio

1. Introduction

Language and culture are inseparable and constitute "a single universe or domain of experience" (Bot et al, 1991:217). The implication is clear: cultural awareness developed by the second culture acquisition necessarily helps attain second language competence. To put it in a different way, the nonnative speakers' inappropriate language behavior or what is called sociolinguistic and sociopragmatic failure often occurs due to their violations of cultural norms of appropriateness in their communications with native language speakers. In this perspective, second language teaching and learning should include both target language and culture learning and teaching. Or to be more exact, second language teaching should be carried out explicitly and implicitly in the second culture teaching. To realize this goal in my ESL teaching, I have introduced an instructional method called a "Literature Circle" into my in ESL classroom and this approach has turned out to be very effective.

A "Literature Circle", which is a student book club in the classroom, has become a hot topic in this decade, especially in the field of literacy instruction. (Daniels 2002) The national literacy standards sanctioned by the National Council of Teachers of English and the International Reading Association in 1996 explicitly identified literature circles as one of the "best classroom practices" in the teaching of (cultural) literacy. Also there has developed an abundant professional literature and research base in this field. (Daniels 2002:7) There has been an array of studies of literature circles in elementary classrooms (McGee 1992; Short 1992; Moller 2002; Whitin 2002; Long & Gove 2003), with adolescents (Noll 1994; Burns 1998), and in elementary and adolescent bilingual classrooms (Martinez-Roldan & Lopez-Robertson 1999; Peralta-Nash & Dutch 2000; Asselin 2003). However, writing on literature circles in ESL classrooms is quite scarce and without documentation of real classroom practice. MacGillivray, Tse & McQuillan (1995) wrote an article on the role of literature circles for ESL learners in a format of a play based on the conversations among the three of them about their personal feelings and experiences with no authentic classroom data.

I believe that students learn through interaction and mediation with others (Vygotsky 1978) and through tool-mediated goal-oriented activities (Leontiev 1978) and that incorporating literature into cultural literacy instruction can model language structures, connect lessons to students' prior knowledge, develop cultural awareness by comparing their own culture with the second culture, and thus motivate students in their learning and using of the second language (Roser & Martinez 1995). Thus, a literature circle appeals to me as it may provide an excellent milieu and may serve as a tool within and with which the students can carry out meaningful interactions and activities in order to learn the target language and at the same time acquire the second culture.

This paper aims to tentatively fill the gap in this field by documenting the application of literature circles in an adult beginner-intermediate ESL classroom through the analysis of audiotape recordings, student journals, and observation field notes on classroom literature circle discussions. The research questions explored in this research study are: Can beginnerintermediate linguistically diverse students talk thoughtfully about target-language literature? Will the limited proficiency in English be an obstacle to their talk about literature? And how can literature circles help improve their English cultural literacy?

2. Data Collection

This study is carried out in one of my classes, an adult beginner-intermediate ESL class in Intensive English Program in one of the big universities in the southern part of the United States. There are altogether ten linguistically and culturally diverse students, aging from 18 to 36, coming from seven different countries, namely Japan, Korea, Taiwan, Malaysia, Panama, Ukraine, and Nigeria. Therefore, English is the only language of communication among them and thus the only possible language for literature circle discussions.

The students are divided into two groups, five people in each with five different discussion roles. Five cycles of discussions are done with everybody taking one role each time through group decision. Every discussion occurs every one and a half weeks and lasts on average 40 minutes. Ethnographic methods are used to collect data. I audio-record the discussions and do observation field notes and students are required to write two reflective journals on literature circle discussions, which are timed after the second cycle and the last one. So altogether 400minutes of audio-recordings, 20 reflective journals, and 5 items of field notes are collected.

3. Literature Circle

3.1 Literature Circle Defined

Daniels (2002) defines a literature circle by clarifying eleven key ingredients, but claims that some of them may be intentionally omitted in accordance with specific conditions. The eleven ingredients are:

- 1) Students choose their own reading materials.
- 2) Small temporary groups are formed, based on book choice.
- 3) Different groups read *different books*.
- 4) Groups meet on a *regular*, *predictable schedule* to discuss their reading.
- 5) Kids use written or drawn *notes* to guide both their reading and discussion.
- 6) Discussion topics come from the students.
- 7) Group meetings aim to be *open, natural conversations about books*, so personal connections, digressions, and open-ended questions are welcome.
- 8) The teacher serves as a *facilitator*, not a group member or instructor.
- 9) Evaluation is by *teacher observation and student self-evaluation*.
- 10) A spirit of *playfulness and fun* pervades the room.
- 11) When books are finished, *readers share with their classmates*, and then *new groups form* around new reading choices.

(Daniels 2002:18, emphasis by the author)



Based on the conditions I have in my classroom, the literature circle I applied complies with most of the eleven key ingredients, namely, numbers 4 to10, but with modifications on numbers 1, 2, 3, and 11.

Choice of reading materials by the students is said to be essential in literature circles. However, in my class, students preferred for me to choose for them. They said it was hard for them to find and decide what reading materials were suitable for them. MacGillivray, Tse & McQuillan (1995) also mention that Tse's ESL students felt uncomfortable with the choices they were asked to make, such as selecting texts, and two students who took the same course in two semesters said they liked the second semester better precisely because there was less choice. Therefore, students may choose not to make their own choices, which does not necessarily make it less of the nature of literature circles.

Another modification is that the discussion groups in my class read the same material and do not form new groups for new readings. The reason for this is that the composition of group members in each group is roughly decided on the basis of their interests and trust in each other. Basically, members within each group are good friends and stay together more often than with others. MacGillivray, Tse & McQuillan (1995) talk about selection of group members and comment that "the group's 'who' is more important than its 'what'; that is, the composition of the group matters more than the book itself." (p. 38) One of the students in my class said, "I like to discuss with student I like. I don't like him. I don't want to with him."

Thus, Daniel's eleven-key-ingredient definition of a literature circle is not necessarily a fixed frame for application. Different practices can be carried out with the aim that students can get the best result and feelings out of the discussions.

3.2 Role Sheets

The five roles that are assigned to the students are discussion director/summarizer, vocabulary enricher, connector, author reflector, and literary enricher (see Table 1 on the next page).

The five roles aim to help the students read with understanding, thinking critically, and discussing and sharing viewpoints and other ideas with each other. And according to what most of the students have written in their journals these are successfully achieved. Here are a few comments that students have written in their journals.

"I think this method is very helpful to us. Everybody has own's role so we must do our best. Also we change our role each time so we understand all parts. We exchange our opinion and it helps us to understand the article more...I tried to think many things about the role and I could understand well when I think about more and more...My habit of reading became different what I used to be before. I used to just read and not to think about it. Through this time I was an author and I imagined my own story. Also, we shared our thought and ideas so I can learn what I can't think about it from my friends." (Stella) (1)

"These roles made the story more easy to understand and I could know more deep about the story." (Mary)

"In this activity, I didn't study these articles by the same way that I usually do. I have

to think more." (Martha)

"I don't have to be worry about the right answers, because everything counts." (Angela)

Discussion	Vocabulary	Literary	Connector	Author
Director/Summarizer	Enricher	Enricher		Reflector
directs the sequence of discussion, keeps the group discussion going by encouraging group members to respond to each other's ideas, and starts the discussion with a brief summary of the reading.	finds words from the reading that are powerful, puzzling, unfamiliar, etc. and introduces the definition (with emphasis on cultural concept), synonyms, antonyms, and part of speech of the words.	helps group members to focus on the developing characters, plot, and writing style of the author.	makes connections between the reading and the students' own culture and life experiences and other writings.	assumes the role of the author and focuses the group members on reflecting as an author. What if you could actually change, modify, or refocus parts of the story?

Table 1. Roles used in literature circles

Basically all the students stick quite strictly to their own roles. Sometimes an activity is designed by a member to involve all the other group members and usually by the end the discussions are opened up and more interactions occur among the group members.

3.3 Reading Materials

At first, in order to orient them into this new activity, I choose two articles as a start. One is titled "Carmelita's Amazing Rescue" (*CAR*), which is about a little girl who accidentally falls out of the window from five-story high and is luckily rescued by three men. The other is a little bit longer, "*Two Years in the Melting Pot*" (*MP*), written by a Chinese writer talking about his personal experience in the United States. Then we move into two short stories, with one by Grace Paley named "Mother" (*MO*) which is a bit harder to understand in terms of writing style, and the other named "Blue Winds Dancing" (*BWD*) by Thomas Whitecloud, an American-Indian, talking about his return on Christmas Eve to the reservation where he grew up and his visit that, however, turns out to be somewhat different from what he expects. The last one is a children's novel, *The Children's Story* (*CS*) by James Clavell, about how a teacher uses unusual methods to teach her kids not just to accept what the others tell them to do but instead to think critically. Since the students' English proficiency is limited, I choose children's literature as the last final long piece with a theme also appropriate for adult learners so that they can understand better, have something to say and will not feel discouraged by the easiness of the material at the same time. In addition, to

develop the students' awareness of different cultures, I choose *Two Years in the Melting Pot* and *Mother* to provide them chances to consciously make cultural comparisons. It turns out to be liked by the students. Stella comments in her journal,

"Especially I don't like reading novel in English cause of too much difficult vocabulary but this time I was very interested it. That was not difficult and each role was very various. I became to think more about novel."

4. Benefits of Literature Circles

Daniels (2002:9) documents the functions of literature circles in his book: "Various versions of book clubs and literature study circles have been found to increase student enjoyment of and engagement in reading (Fox and Wilkinson 1997), to expand children's discourse opportunities (Kaufmann et al. 1997), to increase multicultural awareness (Hansen-Krening & Mizokowa 1997), to promote other perspectives on social issues (Noll 1994), to provide social outlets for students (Alvermann 1997), and to promote gender equity (Evans, Alvermann, and Anders 1998). Other than that we don't know much about lit circles." From my own application of literature circles in ESL class, I would like to add some more to the list.

4.1 Literature circles encourage critical thinking

In the process of reading and fulfilling roles, students have to think deeply and critically, about the characters, the plot, and the author's writing style. Critical thinking is one of the many elements in the students' discussions. The following is one tiny episode of one group's discussion about the story *BWD*.

- Martha: I have a little bit question. What does he mean when he say "I am alone." Because he say "I am alone – alone but not nearly so lonely as I was back on the campus at school." His mean when he stay with people, a lot of people, he feel lonely. But now he stay in forest, alone, but he doesn't feel lonely. Do you know why? Do you have any idea about this? Did you ever have similar experience?
- Joan: I think just because he think that he has such a feel that he, he is not belong this group, although he is, he is in the place with the people, but actually he feel like he is an alien, he is not belong this group. For example, when we went, go to the party, and all of the people are like white or other country people and they are talking the same language. But we are human, but we think we are different. But we can not interrupt them and we can not feel very comfortable.

4.2 Literature circles help to make links to other people and develop trust among members

MacGillivray, Tse & McQuillan (1995) point out one important benefit of literature circles. Literature circles in L2 help students to make links to other people and making connections, which is the goal of learning another language. (p. 39) The students exchange each other's feelings and experiences based on the reading. It is also a means through which the group members can develop their relationship with people of different cultural background and trust among them. They learn to take responsibilities not only for themselves but also for their group members in this team work.

"When I discussed the article with my group, we had good time and relationship. Before, we didn't know each other new students but right now, we have know each other and we are talking a lot lot." (Wilson)

"If I don't study hard, I 'll give harm to my classmates. So although I didn't know or I didn't want to study I tried to do my best. Through this activity, I learned about obligation." (Stella)

"You have to read and think deeply, not only for yourself but also for the other group members...I got many different ideas that I never though(t) before from my group members. It was really interesting. And sometimes my group members gave us some personal examples. Everyone has different background, it means everyone has different life experiences. I really like to share it to each other."

4.3 Literature circle discussions help to improve communication skills

Another benefit of literature circles for ESL learners is that they help to improve communication skills.

"After we finish, learned lots expression from other classmates such as inter activity, sharing information, speaking to group and etc. This is a good tool to improve not only reading about also communication skill at my English." (Joan)

Eileen is a Japanese girl who has difficulty in spoken English and seldom talks in class. She finds out that she has made much progress. Also she finds

"In my last reflections, I could not discuss a lot, so I decided that I would discuss a lot as possible as I can. However, I could not discuss well. But I am satisfied the last discussion because I discussed a lot. Literature Circles helped my discussion skills a lot and I knew what I should do. I want to do Literature Circles more and improve my skills." (Eileen)

4.4 Literature circles provide opportunities for peer assistance

According to Vygotsky, meaningful mediation through which people learn develops within the "zone of proximal development" (ZPD). And he defines the ZPD as the difference between what a person can achieve when acting alone and what the same person can accomplish when acting with support from someone else and/or cultural artifacts. (cited in Lantolf 2000:17) Literature circle discussions provide a milieu and tool for various mediations and interactions through which the ESL students can collaboratively construct their ZPDs to learn the second language and culture including styles of speaking, and so on.

All the students mention in the reflective journals that in literature circle discussions they learn a lot from their group members and some of them even consciously help their peers who do not talk much in class.

"I like to be a Discussion Director/Summarizer. Some students they are always quiet and don't talk to(o) much. I would like to lead them

to talk more and express their opinions more. Sometimes they just need more time to express themselves. If we are patient with them, you will surprise their ideas and logical ability." (Martha)

An excerpt from their discussions about *BWD* can further illustrate this point:

- Kathy: I have a question. On page 21, second paragraph, he talk about city. I can't understand which city. Is he talking about white people's city or city of his people? I don't understand.
- Wilson: You don't understand?
- Angela: He's talking about...OK, let's read it. "The railroad on which I stand comes from a city sprawled by a lake..."

Wilson: It's...

- Angela: "a city with a million people who walk around without seeing one another;..." Yes, he is talking about the city where he was studying because he said that everybody look the same. Look same, simi, they look similar. And this city has police, criminals, zoos, libraries...
- Kathy: So it is the city where he was studying.
- Angela: When he describe the city he was studying, he don't describe, he don't give a description like poet description. I mean, he doesn't say that the police are blue like blueberries, like the pines with shawls, you know,

(Everybody laughs)

- Angela: He said that they have library, zoos and police, you know. And he don't use feelings to describe the city.
- Aerial: He goes straight.
- Angela: He goes straight and that's it. That's mean he has more feelings with his own culture.

5. How Literature Circles Enhance Literacy in English

There have been many scholars and researchers who attempt to expand literacy beyond just encoding and decoding texts. (Brandt 1990; Au 1993) Au (1993:20) defines literacy as "the ability and willingness to use reading and writing to construct meaning from printed text, in ways which meet the requirements of a particular social context." Therefore, literacy is not just a matter of skill or cognitive strategies, it is also a matter of will or feelings and emotions. I would like to add, based on the data I collect, more elements to the definition of literacy.

5.1 Literacy as involvement and social interactions

Brandt (1990) sees literacy as involvement in the sense that readers need to get involved into the text and tie it to their own life experiences. The students in my class really get involved into the readings via making connections with their own experiences and sharing them with group members. One part of the discussion about *CS*, a little boy Johnny discovered and pointed out the teacher's secret of putting candies on their table while they were praying and then the teacher confirmed his words, is very interesting to note.

Eileen: In this story, my favorite paragraph, pa...



Martha: Paragraph.

- Eileen: Ok. It is new teacher's word. "God didn't give you the puppy you wanted. But if you work hard, I will. Only I or someone like me can give you things."...Because I agree with it. I don't believe in God and I don't have any religions...How do you think, Martha?
- Martha: I like this part too because I think the teacher, the teacher's secret be founded. So the teacher didn't make any lying... The teacher say the truth...If I were teacher, maybe I can not say the truth. Maybe I will feel very embarrassing...
- Eileen: How about Wilson?
- Wilson: I think, huh, from this sentence, if I were Johnny, I won't tell the teacher right away...

Eileen: What do you think, Stella?

Stella: I think this teacher is very wise. Like Martha, if I were a teacher, I would feel very embarrassed...But the teacher, she mentioned about "when you work hard, just pray." I have a religion, but pray, they makes me feel more work hard, but yeah, of course, it's my religious, so I believe if I pray hard, God will...

Martha: Hear you.

. . .

- Stella: Yeah, that is just to make, make, me to work hard. Follow the way, I think the teacher mentioned about that. Teacher make the children work hard. So I think the teacher is very wise.
- Joan: I feel like, if I were the teacher, I will also very embarrassed, like because...in Asia the teacher always right. But in most...some of the countries, sometimes you can hear teacher say, "You can correct me if I am not, I am not correct." So I think this sentence make us to think about, huh, the teacher is not always right. Maybe we have to teach our children, like, to think another way to ask the question. Something like that.
- Eileen: Thank you. I very happy because I know other person's feeling and I have no idea people who have religions, what do they think about this sentence. So it's really nice, thank you.

This excerpt shows that the five students in this group, with the leadership of the discussion director, put themselves into the character's shoes and involve their own reactions and feelings in order to understand better. In the process of the involvement, cultural, religious, and social issues are discussed and shared as well.

"The social interaction that takes place in a literature circle is a key component of its success. To be able to verbalize the content, to listen to other modes of thinking, and to hear other perspectives all contribute to deepening comprehension... Literature study moved from an individual act of creating meaning to a social act of negotiating meaning among students." (Burns 1998:126) The students liked the intimacy of the small reading group because it allowed for more opportunity to participate.

"Discussing in a small group is very good way to share feeling with other people and to change opinion each other. After discussed about a article or a book, I could know about it much more than I read it alone. So I like these discussion and it is

very helpful for me to understand the articles." (Mary)

5.2 Literacy as appropriating cultural capital

Students in literature circle discussions very often appropriate their "cultural capital", which serves as a source of motivation and self-esteem for those students whose cultural stories and worlds are unknown to others. (Cited in Asselin 2003) In the following episode of discussion about MO, the members of a group talk about whether teenagers feel a need to express their individuality in their own countries.

- Kathy: This question is very interesting. "Do teenagers feel a need to express their individuality in your country? If so, how? If not, why not?" I think in my country, yes, they do. They express the individuality. But it's, like you can see about clothes, about maybe some jewelry, behave, but it's very different from America. It's different. Like now, I don't know, maybe I'm wrong, but I can just compare with my own family. Like my son, never was worried about his hair, style, about his clothes, he liked all clothes which I bought him. But now, he didn't like the hair style which I like, he wants to be different. He make like funny hairs and I can't find him the clothes which I like. I have to ask him, "Do you like this or not?" I bought him a pair of jeans and he told me, "Mama, I can't wear this jeans, it's ugly for me." Because he look at another children and he wants to be like they. In Ukraine, I think we have more individuality, like we don't have to repeat like another guy's or girl's. I think it's more easy here. It's different.
- Anna: OK, in my country, the teenager have the feeling to express their individuality. They form their way to wear, to talk, to express their idea about politic, about music, about different things. So they have different ways to express their individuality. So yes, in my country, it is really free like here in America. Like here in the United States, not so much like here in the United States.

Inna: It's too much freedom.

- Anna: Yes, here too much free. So my country, we have some reservations, but even, even, teenagers try to express their ideas. So yes, we have this feeling in my country.
- Inna: Abies, in your country, men or women express individuality?
- Abies: Both.
- Inna: Both?
- Abies: Yes.
- Inna: But I remember like woman don't have a lot of right like men.
- Abies: Yeah, some places. It depends on where you come from. And it was in old days, like in the 60s and 80s, like woman can not express their feelings, but now they can.
- Anna: But now it depends on the area?
- Abies: It depends on the area.
- Inna: I think like in big cities, it's more difficult to express individuality, but in small village,...
- Abies: Yeah, but from village, you can't.
 - 132

As noted earlier, culture teaching should become an integral part of language teaching. In this regard, both explicit and implicit teaching of the second culture in terms of values, ways of perceiving the world, and so on is not only necessary but also important. The discussions about the values underlying interpersonal relationship in the classroom no doubt serve as a good start in ESL teaching as an integral part of culture teaching as it helps the students see the world through the eyes of a different culture and step into a different culture and thus be enabled to further improve their second language learning.

6. Conclusion

Based on the data I collected, it is reasonable to say that beginner-intermediate linguistically and culturally diverse students can talk thoughtfully about target-language literature and their limited proficiency in English is not an obstacle to their thoughtful talk about literature. A literature circle, as a literacy event, helps to improve their cultural literacy in English not only in the sense of reading and writing, but also in the sense that their communication skills in English, which are inherently part of culture, are enhanced. This approach can easily involve almost all the participants in the readings via making connections with their own and their group members' cultures and experiences, and thus motivate them to willingly develop their literacy skills in the target language through reading, discussing and appropriating their prior knowledge. However, the experiment is just a start on the journey to the ESL teaching in the teaching of second culture. The realization of this goal needs further well-organized and systematic efforts.

Note: All the students' names are pseudonyms.

References

- Alvermann, D. E. (1997) Adolescents' Negotiations of Out-of-School Reading Discussions. Reading Research Report No. 77. Athens, GA: National Reading Research Center.
- Asselin, M. (2003). Literacy and Diversity: Working with the Grain. *Teacher Librarian* 30, 4: 53-54.
- Au, K. H. (1993). *Literacy Instruction in Multicultural Settings*. Harcourt Brace College Publishers.
- Bot, K. D., Ginsberg, R. B., & Kramsch, C. (Eds) (1991). Foreign Language Research in Cross-cultural Perspective. Amsterdam ; Philadelphia: J. Benjamins.
- Brandt, D. (1990). *Literacy as Involvement: The Acts of Writers, Readers and Texts*. Southern Illinois University Press.
- Burns, B. (1998). Changing the Classroom Climate with Literature Circles. *Journal of Adolescent and Adult Literacy* 42, 2: 124-129.

Clavell, J. (1981). The Children's Story. Delacorte Press.

- Daniels, H. (2002). *Literature Circles: Voice and Choice in Book Clubs and Reading Groups*. Stenhouse Publishers & Pembroke Publishers Limited.
- Evans, K. S., D. Alvermann, & P. L. Anders. (1998) Literature Discussion Groups: An Examination of Gender Roles. *Reading Research and Instruction* 37:2, 107-122.
- Fox, M. & L. Wilkinson. (1997) No Longer Travelers in a Strange Country. Journal of Children's Literature 23:1, 6-15.

- Hansen-Krening, N. & D. T. Mizokawa. (1997) Exploring Ethinc-Specific Literature: a Unity of Parents, Families, and Educators. *Journal of Adolescent and Adult Literacy* 41:3, 180-188.
- Kaufmann, G. Lantolf, J. P. (2000). *Sociocultural Theory and Second Language Learning*. Oxford University Press.
- Kauffman, G., Short, K., Crawford, K., Kahn, L., and Kaser, S. (1996). Examining the roles of teachers and students in literature circles across classroom contexts. In Leu, D., Kinzer, C., and Hinchman, K. (Eds.) Literacies for the 21st Century: Research and Practice. Chicago, IL: National Reading Conference. pp. 373-384.
- Leontiev, A. N. (1978). Activity, Consciousness and Personality. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Long, T. W. & Gove, M. K. (2003). How Engagement Strategies and Literature Circles Promote Critical Response in a Fourth-grade, Urban Classroom. *The Reading Teacher* 57, 4: 350-361.
- MacGillivray, L., Tse, L. & McQuillan, J. (1995). Second Language and Literacy Teachers Considering Literature Circles: A Play. *Journal of Adolescent and Adult Literacy* 39, 1: 36-44.
- Martinez-Roldan, C. M. & Lopez-Robertson, J. M. (1999). Initiating Literature Circles in a First-grade Bilingual Classroom. *The Reading Teacher* 53, 4: 270-281.
- McGee, L. (1992). An Exploration of Meaning Construction in First Graders' Grand Conversations. In C. Kinzer & D. Leu. (Eds.) *Literacy Research, Theory, and Practice: Views from Many Perspectives.* 41st Yearbook of the National Reading Conference, Chicago National Reading Conference. pp. 177-187.
- Moller, K. J. (2002). Providing Support for Dialogue in Literature Discussions about Social Justice. Language Arts 79, 6: 467-477.
- Noll, E. (1994). Social Issues and Literature Circles with Adolescents. *Journal of Adolescent* and Adult Literacy 38, 2: 88-93.
- Peralta-Nash, C. & Dutch, J. A. (2000). Literature Circles: Creating an Environment for Choice. *Primary Voices K-6* 8, 4: 29-37.
- Short, K. (1986). Literacy as Collaborative Experience. PhD Dissertation, Indiana University.
- Short, K. (1992). Intertextuality: Searching for Patterns that Connect. In C. Kinzer & D. Leu. (Eds.) Literacy Research, Theory, and Practice: Views from Many Perspectives. 41st Yearbook of the National Reading Conference, Chicago National Reading Conference. pp. 187-198.
- Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). *Mind in Society*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Whitin, P. (2002). Leading into Literature Circles through the Sketch-to-sketch Strategy. *The Reading Teacher* 55, 5: 444-450.